

Reviews

Christopher Fleet and Daniel MacCannell, *Edinburgh: Mapping the City* (Edinburgh, Birlinn, 2014). xvi + 303 pp. + 71 maps. ISBN 978 1 78027 245 0. Hbk. £30.

John Moore, *Glasgow: Mapping the City* (Edinburgh, Birlinn, 2015). xiv + 274pp. + 80 maps. ISBN 978 1 78027 319 8. Hbk. £30.

These are lavishly and lovingly produced companion volumes. The authors and the publisher are to be congratulated in revealing the spatial development of Scotland's two largest cities from the sixteenth century to the present in such splendid cartographic detail and to a very high standard of production. Fleet and Moore bring their extensive professional cartographic experience to bear on the selection of maps; MacCannell adds to the Edinburgh volume through his knowledge of landscapes and buildings. All told there are over 150 original maps reproduced with fine attention to their context and interpretation. The authors also compile bibliographies relating to cartographic materials, websites where the original documents can be consulted, and wide-ranging thematic indexes to the texts.

Companion volumes might be expected to share common features, and that is the case for these two books. Typographically and cartographically they are twins. Organisationally, both volumes are chronologically driven, with a mix of early picturesque 'maps', followed by privately surveyed maps and then by the great Victorian Ordnance Survey mapping of the 1850s and 1870s which provide, along with Post Office directory maps, a very secure understanding of the spatial character of Glasgow and Edinburgh. In content there are close parallels, too, with both volumes using the earliest printed map of the burgh to begin the chronological organisation of the volume, followed by the Roy Military Survey, hill-top overviews of the 1690s, international exhibition sites in the 1880s, German military maps from 1941, town planning proposals post-1945, and even comparable data on the distribution of licensed premises. This does not render the volumes as clones; it does make for intriguing cross-references between the cities to consider broader thematic issues of urban history.

Glasgow: Mapping the City includes just thirteen maps before 1800; *Edinburgh: Mapping the City* provides almost double that number (24) and this reflects the relative position of both in the Scottish urban hierarchy in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries. Thereafter, in both volumes, intervals between the maps are short. Moore selects six Glasgow maps for the 1820s, three in the 1830s, seven in the 1840s, six in the 1850s, and so on until the twentieth century when there are only ten in total. The temporal distribution adopted by Fleet and MacCannell is not dissimilar. The pattern reflects the most rapid period of urbanisation in Scottish history – the first four decades of the nineteenth century – and the environmental and financial challenges that this presented to town councils in the wake of social and economic transformations.

Understanding the spaces for which the Glasgow and Edinburgh municipal authorities were responsible, and their expanding obligations regarding urban management, meant there was a need to commission maps, and then to rely on a national standard, the Ordnance Survey. This is where the authors make important contributions beyond that of their cartographic ones. They reveal the underground city of public utilities, and the web of transport links above it; they show the spread of suburbanisation and remind us of the concentration of disease and drunkenness in the city centres, and of the imperative of removing foul water and slaughtered carcasses. Specialist maps covering topics such as police beats, gas lighting, fire insurance, sewers and drains, trains and trams each bring urban management into sharper focus. This is not sustained in long wordy chapters but in three or four succinct pages in which the relevant maps are embedded, and this model serves both authors and readers well. An overarching explanatory synthesis is neither intended nor attempted. What is most effectively conveyed is the significance that the specific map had for understanding a particular facet of urban life.

Any selection is open to criticism. More might have been done to include landownership estate maps in Edinburgh; might not more on the location of industry have been attempted in the Glasgow volume? The inclusion of local plans would have fleshed out coverage of the twentieth century, and perhaps heat maps and digital representations derived from the Scottish Neighbourhood Statistics could have given a 21st-century dimension to the volumes. But these are the perennial problems of selection, and of space and cost constraints. And it is part of the fun too – like team selection or Desert Island Discs choices – each of us speculates about our favourites or the significance or the aesthetic of the maps. The authors are to be commended for their choices, and for stimulating a greater public awareness of cartographic assets as a basis of urban analysis and interpretation. Similarities and variations in the urban fabric and social composition are what contribute to urban identity and place attachment, and the maps presented in association with the publisher's excellent standards of production help us to grapple with such themes.

Richard Rodger

University of Edinburgh

Sara Stevenson and A. D. Morrison-Low, *Scottish Photography: The First Thirty Years* (Edinburgh, National Museums Scotland, 2015). xii + 383 pp. ISBN 978 1 905267 99 6. Pbk. £25.

A. D. Morrison-Low, *Photography: A Victorian Sensation* (Edinburgh, National Museums Scotland, 2015). ix + 86 pp. ISBN 978 1 905267 95 8. Pbk. £12.99.

It is remarkable how the history of Scottish photography in the past 40 years has risen from a marginal enthusiasm of the few to a discipline of repute and consequence in cultural circles. No one has played a greater part in this

transformation than these two, whose careers as curators have been in the forefront of change. ‘Post hoc, ergo propter hoc’ does not always hold true but it does in the case of this duo. *Scottish Photography: The First Thirty Years* brings together all their knowledge and expertise into a wonderfully readable and comprehensive account, a superb summation, of the development of photography in Scotland between c.1840 and 1880, and the work of photographers both in Scotland and from Scotland. They draw on more than 30 years of collecting, curating, researching and writing. Their successful nurturing of relations with prescient collectors such as Bernard Howarth-Loomes is a story in itself, and is reflected in the number of prints from that source. They have ranged far and wide, in early photographic journals and literature, manuscripts and journals, in collections here and there throughout Britain such as the Royal Archives and further afield. No stone seems to have been left unturned.

It is remarkable how they bring together a combination of skills to explain the technological changes, the chemical processes, the commercial imperatives, and the artistic perspectives. We are taken through the ways in which images and landscapes were captured before photography, as with the camera obscura. And then consider the arrival of the daguerreotype process in 1839, taken up quickly in Scotland and developed there. How, where, and by whom, is a fascinating story. As one would expect, the big names feature: Sir David Brewster, David Octavius Hill and Robert Adamson, but also many lesser or less well-known lights such as John Muir Wood, a musical entrepreneur who organised concerts in Glasgow for Chopin in 1848. It may have been Mendelssohn’s music that prompted Muir Wood to take the first photograph of Fingal’s Cave in 1850. Portrait and landscape work were to be a profitable pairing for many photographers, as with the calotype and daguerreotypist partnership of Ross & Thomson. A selection of their Edinburgh views were sold to the Queen in May 1849, and earned the firm the Royal Warrant as Photographers at Edinburgh to her Majesty. They along with others submitted a portfolio to the Great Exhibition at the Crystal Palace in 1851, and were awarded a medal. This partnership was in the van of exploiting the market for views, increasingly in demand by tourists, and sent out their assistants on photographic missions. The firm, incidentally, and this is yet another delightful gleaning, in 1853 were first in the industry to allow their staff a Saturday half-day. Demand for stereo views, scraps and photographic albums took off: one agent in Scotland reported in March 1857 that he had sold no less than eight or nine thousand stereo slides within the last three months. It was a market into which other firms entered with enthusiasm including George Washington Wilson of Aberdeen, James Valentine of Dundee and Thomas Annan of Glasgow. Work from all three features in this study, along with images from those Scots who worked abroad, John Thomson in China, William Carrick and John MacGregor in St Petersburg, and Alexander Gardner, whose photographs of dead Confederate sharpshooters at Gettysburg are defining images of the American Civil War. There are many other photographs of note in this lavishly illustrated volume, including ones of David Livingstone and Madeleine Smith, known for rather different reasons.

Photography: A Victorian Sensation is a guide and souvenir of the exhibition organised in 2015 by Morrison-Low which showcased the photographic images and apparatus that are held by National Museums Scotland from early daguerreotype cameras to the calotype albums of Dr John Adamson, and later acquisitions. While there is inevitably some overlap in terms of content and illustrations with *Scottish Photography: The First Thirty Years*, there are additions, such as the 'carte-de-visite' taken in 1857 of Isambard Kingdom Brunel, and a running on of the story into the later nineteenth century, when cheap photography was accessible to all. There is a panoramic view of a packed beach at Ramsgate in 1882, and two souvenir images of a family on their day out at Margate, or so detective work established from the lettering on a bucket held by one of the boys. An atmospheric view by the Edinburgh photographer Moffat of St Cuthbert's church at the west end of Princes Street in the snow, took my eye. But there is something for everyone, whether interested in commercial or artistic photography, studio or outdoor work, history or humour. The frontispiece is a montage of the actor Richard Mansfield as Dr Jekyll and Mr Hyde, in which roles he had made his stage reputation in London. Some publications are once read, enjoyed and then shelved. These are for continuing pleasure and interest.

Alastair Durie

University of Stirling

Sharon Adams and Julian Goodare (eds), *Scotland in the Age of Two Revolutions* (Woodbridge, The Boydell Press, 2014). xiv + 253 pp. ISBN 978 1 84383 939 2. Hbk. £65.

A recent criticism of the historiography of Britain during the seventeenth century is its Anglocentric nature, focusing on the events and dates which were most important in England. *Scotland in the Age of Two Revolutions* adds to the increasing body of work addressing this problem. The book's editors, Sharon Adams and Julian Goodare, lay out their case in the opening chapter of the volume, stating that this collection of work is attempting to break the frame of 1603 and 1707. Instead, they suggest that 1638 and 1689 provide a much more relevant and accurate foundation for Scotland's seventeenth century.

The following eleven chapters seek to provide the evidence for this striking argument. The chapters are organised in a broadly chronological order, focusing primarily on the political and religious history of Scotland (and prominent Scots) from the Union of the Crowns in 1603 to the collapse of the Company of Scotland in the first few years of the eighteenth century. Within this chronology, there is an impressive geographical coverage, with the Highlands and Islands being represented in Sherilynn Theiss's thought-provoking chapter on the western Highlands in the years preceding the Civil Wars, and Danielle McCormack's section on Highland lawlessness during the Cromwellian occupation. The Borders are also covered in Anna Groundwater's

insightful chapter on the ‘Middle Shires’, and James VI and I’s attempts to incorporate the Borders into his vision of a ‘Great Britain’.

Julian Goodare’s theory-orientated analysis of the acceptability of the term ‘Revolution’ in the Scottish context signals the book’s shift from the Civil War era to its aftermath. Sharon Adams’ section on the search for Scottish Republicanism neatly follows Goodare’s chapter, and provides a fascinating discussion of how contemporary Scots viewed political power and Scotland’s almost unshakeable attachment to the ideal of monarchy. The Restoration era is then covered in chapters from Maurice Lee and Caroline Erskine, which look at the Restoration regime in Scotland and the political thought of the Restoration Covenanters respectively. The book concludes with chapters focusing on the Revolution of 1688–89 and its consequences. Alasdair Raffe provides a stimulating essay on the role of oath taking, with particular reference to the infamous Test Acts. This is followed by chapters from Laura Rayner on the day-to-day governance of ‘Williamite’ Scotland, and Douglas Watt’s concluding chapter on the political connections of the managers of the Company of Scotland.

There is variation in the quality of the contributions. Among the most notable is Sally Tuckett’s essay on the Scottish Bishops during the late Jacobean and Caroline eras, which shows a remarkable level of detail in her research. Again, Danielle McCormack’s contribution must be mentioned for its superb employment of a wide range of source material, from the personal correspondence of General Monck to Gaelic poetry. Other chapters are less original. In particular, Maurice Lee’s chapter is really a short synopsis of his previous research into Lauderdale, while Douglas Watt’s chapter on the Company of Scotland leans heavily on his book *The Price of Scotland* (Edinburgh, 2007). Having said this, both chapters provide much needed chronological sign posts which aid the reader to traverse the book.

In terms of source material used in this book, there is extensive use of printed sources. The Royal Privy Council records are employed by a number of the contributors, and due to the discursive nature of some of these essays, many of the other sources have been at the centre of previous research, such as the polemic Alexander Shields, and Sir James Balfour. However, this does not diminish the value of the chapters, as many of these sources are used to revise and contest the established historiography. Sally Tuckett does this particularly well. Additionally, the contributions of Danielle McCormack and Alasdair Raffe in particular, provide the reader with an impressive abundance of source material.

The book’s main flaw is in its ambitious aim to redefine the historiography of seventeenth-century Scotland. The editors are explicit in the introduction of this volume that the cornerstone dates of 1603 and 1707 take away from the Scots themselves, and that they allow for external influences to dominate the Scottish story. While one must always be wary of England’s shadow, which envelopes Scottish history at times, it is a fundamental factor in the development of Scotland during the seventeenth century. You would be hard pressed to

find anyone that disagrees that 1603 or 1707 are two of the most important dates in Scottish history, let alone the seventeenth century. The contributors themselves struggle to avoid this with many of the chapters inadvertently (and not so inadvertently) discussing the Union of 1603 or 1707 in some capacity. While many Scottish historians would agree that 1638 and 1689 deserve much more of the historiographical limelight than they get in the Scottish context, few would argue that 1603 or 1707 were undeserving of it.

If this book can be taken as a collection of essays on Scotland's seventeenth century, it succeeds in providing a fresh and engaging body of work, which might not be entirely ground-breaking, but is certainly a helpful and enriching contribution to the historiography of the period.

Andrew Lind

University of Glasgow

Julian Goodare (ed.), *Scottish Witches and Witch-Hunters* (Palgrave Historical Studies in Witchcraft and Magic, Basingstoke, Palgrave Macmillan, 2013). xiii + 258 pp. ISBN 978 1 137 35593 5. Hbk. £62.

Palgrave's series of 'Historical Studies in Witchcraft and Magic' is growing in importance as a collection of both monographs and collected essays which bring to a wider audience the results of recent scholarly research and lucubration, and thanks to Julian Goodare, Scotland is handsomely represented. It is also refreshing and interesting to read work by several new scholars – seven out of the twelve authors in this volume, in fact – whose delving into archival and published primary sources brings new eyes to some of the intriguing themes discussed here. The connecting theme of the essays which make up this volume is that of 'hunting'. 'Hunting' is perhaps not always the happiest term to apply to the prosecution of witches, because it implies an attempt to track down and then eradicate the witch, whereas in a large number, indeed the majority of cases, the witch does not need to be hunted, since she or he was already well-known to both neighbours and the authorities, and was prosecuted for the crime of practising magic in much the same way as others were prosecuted for murder, theft, or false-coining. 'Hunt' is therefore an emotive term which might be best avoided except in relation to specific instances to which it can properly be applied, and generally speaking these are uncommon in Scotland.

This is not to say, of course, that there were no large-scale prosecutions of witches in Scotland. There certainly were, and some of the essays here deal with aspects of one or two of those outbreaks. The historical period covered by the volume broadly ranges from the mid-sixteenth to the mid-eighteenth century and begins with Michael Wasser's discussion of a hitherto largely unknown or ignored episode which took place during the East Coast Justice Ayres of 1568–69. This seems to have been fuelled by two 'godly magistrates' in particular, the Regent Moray and John Erskine of Dun, and the cooperation between Kirk and State which they embody is paralleled in another extensive

episode, that of 1649–50, discussed by Paula Hughes, who shows how much the intensification of prosecution at this time owed to the Covenanters' seizure of power (they and the earlier Moray-Erskine combination being the 'witch-hunters' of the volume's title). Both Hughes and Wasser make good use of unpublished material both legal and presbytery/kirk session records, as does Anna Cordey in her essay on community relationships and witch prosecution in the presbytery of Dalkeith in the mid-seventeenth century. Alexandra Hill, too, in her penetrating contribution on the simultaneous decline and survival of witch prosecution in the early decades of the eighteenth century, leans upon session records for much of the material of her discussion, as does Lauren Martin in her study of how interpersonal strife adversely affected one particular individual from the parish of Dunbar in the 1620s. In an essay combining research in both Danish and Scottish records, Liv Helene Willumsen suggests (not altogether successfully), that a Scotsman appointed District Governor of Finnmark in 1619 brought with him Scottish attitudes and beliefs anent witches, whose influence bore upon the prosecution of witches in his district for the rest of the century.

A remarkably interesting contribution is made by Laura Paterson on the costs and mechanics of executing Scottish witches. This is a side of prosecution which is not often dealt with in any detail, and illustrates what an expense to and a burden upon the community the execution of witches could be. That it was considered a worthwhile, indeed a necessary imposition on her or his fellow-citizens shows the seriousness with which both the social community and the legal authorities met the challenge made to them by what was regarded as the presence of palpable evil in their midst. It would be fruitful to compare further the felt necessity to prosecute and execute witches to certain other outbreaks of perceptions of evil in the community, such as werewolves, vampires, or, in more modern times, paedophiles.

The remaining essays are connected with aspects of Scottish witches' behaviour rather than their 'hunters'. Emma Wilby reprises her longer study of Isobel Gowdie in Nairnshire; Julian Goodare examines witches' alleged ability to fly and draws particular attention to it as a belief especially common in Scotland (it would be interesting to compare this to similar instances elsewhere in Europe, and to ask whether it coincided with accounts of saints' ability to fly, or not). A joint essay by Margaret Dudley and Julian Goodare ventures into the field of sleep paralysis and false memory, an area covered in Edward Bever's detailed investigation of the connection between certain physiological states and witches' claims or the claims made by others for them.

All in all, the collection makes a valuable contribution to the Palgrave series in which it is published, and helps to show how much insight can be gained from judicious use of available archival material.

P. G. Maxwell-Stuart

University of St Andrews

Margaret Stewart, *The Architectural, Landscape and Constitutional Plans of the Earl of Mar, 1700–32* (Dublin, Four Courts Press, 2016). 448 pp. + 186 illus. ISBN 978 1 84682 5750. €45.50.

Having worked on John Erskine, 6th Earl of Mar, for many years, Margaret Stewart is undoubtedly the world authority on his role as the leading amateur architect of the Scotland of his day – and very probably of any day. She has published a number of important articles on his designs for architecture and landscape. I have had the pleasure of hearing her give some sparkling lectures on Mar's activities in these fields. And so it was with more than ordinary excitement and expectation that I began to read her 'magnum opus'.

Margaret Stewart has long been on a personal crusade to restore the reputation of Lord Mar, and to rescue his name from the stains of what she calls slur and misunderstanding. Most of this opprobrium stems from Mar's Jacobitism, his role as prime begetter of the '15 Rebellion, and the disrepute he acquired in his lifetime as 'Bobbing John' (an epithet which, interestingly, she seeks to explain in terms of the man's physical attributes or deformities), a creature of uncertain political judgement and dubious loyalty to any one cause. Rather cleverly she has sought to effect that reinstatement of Mar's honour by demonstrating what she interprets as clear analogies between Mar's architectural and landscape planning, and his political planning (or scheming, as many contemporaries would have regarded it). Her thesis is that Mar was interested in notions of historical continuity and adaptability or what she terms Mar's idea of an 'energized tradition' in Scottish history, society and culture, and particularly in its architectural expression. This book, which looks at all these facets of Mar's world, is the fullest statement yet of Stewart's personal commitment to Mar's memory, his many-sided talent, and his legacy to posterity. The questions facing a reviewer are these. Is the idea of integrating all these aspects of one life and its achievements in several fields, thus bringing together the different compartments (if one likes to put it so) of one mind, a scheme that really works? And does this make for a good, a coherent or balanced book?

The Architectural, Landscape and Constitutional Plans of the Earl of Mar is undeniably of real importance and a work of considerable ambition. It is founded on a unique understanding of the hundreds of Mar's drawings that have survived and which are today in the National Records of Scotland. These form, apparently, the largest single archive of drawings of any single Scottish architect of the eighteenth century, that of the Adam brothers only excepted. They were drawn in exile in many different European locations. They were copied, recopied and reworked. They were subject to the many hazards and losses of a peripatetic existence: some fell 'en route' into the Brenner Pass, and we know that a further entire volume is no longer extant. The survival of the collection at all is a matter of great good fortune. That the drawings are publicly available is a further cause of satisfaction to all interested in British and European architectural history. In addition to her deep study of the drawings,

Margaret Stewart's extended work has been based on wide research in Scottish, English, French and Italian archives, including many sources of Jacobite interest such as the Stuart Papers at Windsor. The evidence of contemporary imaginative, moralising or satiric literature is even adduced. Her references indicate the breadth and depth of her research. So, from the archival point of view, the book is a considerable achievement in showing the power of sources of this kind. Mar's remarkable architectural drawings and landscape plans are used, most effectively, as historical, social and economic documents in an intriguing and enterprising way. It is very good to see these exceptionally important, intriguing and elegant drawings made available and placed more than ever before in the public domain. The selection of drawings which has been reproduced, usually in full colour, makes the book a valuable contribution to Scottish architectural history. It sets the work apart from some of its recent peers, physically and aesthetically, as a thing of beauty. All British architectural historians will want to own it and will need to refer to it. All academic libraries will need to buy it. Scots everywhere will find it intriguing.

In his admirably judicious treatment of Lord Mar in his great *Biographical Dictionary of British Architects* the late Sir Howard Colvin summed up the situation with dry economy. 'Two passions appear to have dominated Mar's life in exile: political intrigue and architectural design. With the former this Dictionary is not concerned ...'. It is, perhaps, a pity that Margaret Stewart had not followed Sir Howard's policy and confined herself to a more lengthy, even more penetrating and a yet more fully illustrated study of Mar's fascinating architectural and landscape work than she had previously been able to offer in her articles. She could surely have done this very well, and to great effect. But perhaps she should really have stopped at that. However, in looking also, as she does (and in such great, if rather confusing detail) at Mar's political life and wider world of court and cabinet intrigue, she allows her vision to become unfocused, even unbalanced. Her track wanders backwards and forwards and (it has to be said) all over the place. Her readers almost lose their way and perhaps even sometimes their interest. Her book forfeits cohesion. This is a very great pity, and it will be a real disappointment to her many friends and admirers who must surely have expected a full-length analysis of the mind and achievement – even if that achievement was, to a great extent, one of paper dreams ranging from the delightfully compact to the massively grandiloquent – of a man who must rate as Scotland's greatest amateur architectural designer and one whose output was extraordinary.

Thus her book is, most regrettably, also a thing of frustration in the way it consumes its own structure and confuses the reader by its constant comings and goings in time, place, theme, the same architectural and landscape projects being visited, and revisited and visited yet again as the book moves forwards. In the end it is neither a biography, nor a complete political study of 'bobbing John', nor yet the work of purely architectural and landscape history that, probably, it should have been. Clearly Margaret Stewart wanted to go further than she had gone before; but in pursuing Mar down many political and economic alleys

she drags the reader away from what in all probability he or she really wanted to know – which is more about the extraordinary architectural scheming and dreaming of a very talented designer.

There is real emotional power in the beautifully drawn record of these paper palaces shut up in Mar's great folio plan-books. One thinks of the originator of the designs taking them out and reworking them of a sultry evening as he moved in his years of exile around Europe, thinking all the time of what he might, perchance see built back in 'Ancient Kingdom' should his King ever enjoy his own again. The same 'commissions' that no one, of course, had actually commissioned might be reworked in Urbino, then in Geneva, then in Paris, and at last at Aix-la-Chapelle. But the frequently introduced political sections are very disruptive. The repeated, and extremely confusing and unclear, excursions into world of Jonathan Swift seem entirely misplaced (though a Dublin publisher may have been snared by these very characteristics of the manuscript) and even to be far-fetched. And there are a disturbing number of occasions where the author cannot suppress her desire to indulge in a Scottish nationalist polemic.

These criticisms aside, there are unquestionably fascinating things to be learned even among the less satisfactory 'political' parts of the book. Mar's proposals for a union of England, Scotland, Ireland and France, which would be joined as equals in a federal constitution that would secure the peace of Europe, is one such discovery that will intrigue the reader. The Earl's even stranger suggestion, made in 1723, that Great Britain be divided between the houses of Hanover and Stuart, with the German interlopers (as he saw them) being allocated England and the colonies of the East and West Indies, and the latter taking Scotland and Ireland along with North America, will astonish the reader to an even greater degree.

It would be dishonest not to point out that the book contains a fair number of errors of fact and opinion. Statements contradict each other, sometimes serially and repeatedly. Some of the evidence of plans and drawings seems to be misinterpreted. Some statements are simply wrong. For example, what is said on page 349 about William Adam's ascription of the authorship of a number of the House of Dun plans in *Vitruvius Scoticus* is simply not borne out by Adam's own inscriptions on those very engravings, and the author should have referred back to some of her own earlier illustrations. An inscription given on page 32 is misread. A fascinating and evocative detail visible in Stewart's plate 146 is apparently missed, or at any rate goes unremarked: the pediment of a new house designed for Alloa, presumably to be built following a restoration of the Jacobite monarchy and Mar's triumphant return to his estates from exile, contains the Erskine arms surmounted by a ducal coronet and encircled by the Garter, both of which honours were Jacobite ones unrecognised by Hanoverian authority. Here the needy hopefulness of exile and attainer are palpable. The supposed Venetian sources of the Alloa Tower entrance which are advanced on page 34 may be feasible; but the chronology most certainly is not, as Longhena actually died in 1682. Mrs Henrietta Howard cannot really

have been, as is said here on the same page (p. 180, and again on p. 262), mistress of both George I and George II. The elder George so hated his son that he would hardly have either shared with him, or passed on to him, the same lady! Further, it is almost impossible to tell from the text on page 262 who married whom, whose son was whose and where they all lived; and some of their names are misspelled. The documentary evidence really does not in any way suggest that a single gilded ornament for Mar's house in the Privy Garden at Whitehall, which he occupied as joint Secretary of State for Scotland, could possibly have cost the truly staggering £3,000 that Stewart asserts (p. 293).

The author has not been well served by her editor. There are not infrequent oddities of style and misspellings. It is, for example, particularly unfortunate that 'Sheriffmuir' should be misspelled in the current Earl of Mar and Kellie's Foreword; and that subsequently the author herself should spell the place of the battle both correctly and incorrectly, apparently at random! There is no clear principle upon which the word 'principal' is spelled.

However, all such errors, misreadings and misinterpretations are, in a way, made up for in the excellent selection of plates. These illustrations, which should really have been the solid archival (or graphic) core round which a smaller, tighter and more focused book should have been constructed, show admirably that Mar's designs are both impressive and fascinating. The way the riparian landscape of the Forth valley is 'called in' to the section of the staircase of the House of Alloa (plate 22) is highly unusual in an architectural drawing. The reservoir up on the roof of the house was to serve a dual purpose: fire precaution water-tank and duck-pond. The whimsical Mar even drew the ducks swimming about (plate 14). This allows the author to employ a happy and memorable phrase on page 45 in connection with a perspective view of the house (plate 18) in which she detects the figure of Mar himself, up on the leads, looking to Stirling Castle in the distance. 'Ducks cluck at his feet, the pulley-chair squeaks as it is cranked up to the parapet – and the image is one of a house in which war is resolved into peace, exile into return, and antiquity into modernity'. Delightful! Although the reader may balk at sorting out in the mind the designs for the so-called 'House J' from those of 'House of Dun "A"', or 'Hunt Hall K' from proposals for domed alterations to Drumlanrig or Wilton, or the magnificent 'House A' (for a site in Piccadilly) from the equally splendid 'House C' at Twickenham, one cannot but be amazed at the fertility of Mar's invention and by his skill and taste. The sheer variety and delight of the many different elevations proposed for 'House L' give the knowledgeable reader such pleasure and instruction that he is tempted to overlook the confusion that will have entered his head as to which location, what for, and for whom this paper palace was intended: for a restored His Majesty King James VIII and III, or for His Grace the Duke of Mar, KG, KT, himself once again in his domestic state (though the caption to plate 108 seems to confuse, or not to differentiate between, these two orders of chivalry)? The text referring to the mysterious, multifunction and flexibly locatable 'House L', the relevant plate captions and the placing of the plates themselves (no. 109 and thereafter nos. 131–41) are

rather hard to follow and to make complete sense of. But what buildings, and what vision! It is a nice touch to see a carved or cast representation even of Mar's own manuscript testimonial, his 'Jewels for Scotland', taking its place among the decorative ornamental iconography on one face of his proposed memorial obelisk at Alloa (plate 184 and page 358). Who would not wish to while away a summer afternoon on a cleverly designed revolving seat positioned so conveniently near (i.e. directly above) an ice-house, whence might come cool sweetmeats and cold drinks for refreshment (plate 164)?

Lord Mar likened life in lonely, stateless, transient exile to eating eggs without either salt or pepper. This book, important though it undoubtedly is, has much too much salt (the confused structure) and rather too much pepper (the very lengthy political sections, the tangential Swiftian excursions, and the polemical passages). But at least we have the architectural eggs; and how very appetising they are.

Iain Gordon Brown

John H. Ballantyne (ed.), *Naught But Trouble: The Hays in Yell, 1755–1824* (Lerwick, Shetland Times, 2014). viii + 480 pp. ISBN 978 1 904746 83 6. Pbk. £25.99.

This book captures both a fascinating period and place of fundamental and revolutionary change: Shetland in the later eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries. We tend to associate economic revolution in Scotland with urbanisation and industry, but rural Scotland was a revolutionary place in its own right, even in areas that we tend now to associate with the periphery of the British Isles. In this welcome volume, Ballantyne gives the reader the first-hand materials to build a picture of these changes, through the lens of one family – the Hays in Yell. The Hays were one of many such middling, aspirational and ambitious families who were the drivers of rural capitalism in this period.

This book is primarily a transcribed collection of the archival resources relating to the Hays and their associated business concerns and tenancies, across a number of generations. It takes the family from its struggling origins, often on the verge of bankruptcy, to its later Shetland-wide dominance as one of the greatest of merchant firms in the islands. The transcriptions are entitled 'extracts' and make up the vast majority of the book, although there is some supporting apparatus to help the reader unfamiliar with Shetland navigate the many people and places touched by this wide-ranging family. A bibliography, references, cast of characters, list of place names, lists of ships, supporting appendices as well as fine maps and images are all offered here and do much to assist the reader. Overall, it is a handsomely produced volume.

The extracts are taken from a number of different archival collections, located in Shetland, Edinburgh and Canada. They have been organised chronologically, to make it as easy as possible for the reader to build a picture

of the activities of the Hays, although perhaps unsurprisingly, the bulk of the extracts come from the nineteenth century, when their range of business expanded exponentially. The extracts themselves consist of a very wide range of materials, most commonly correspondence, but also contracts, leases, sasines, rentals and ledgers. If this sounds rather dry, then be assured it is not. These extracts are full of human and family relationships, with affection and conflict by turns dominant. Overall they represent an extremely detailed record of the building of a successful (if risky) rural business empire, at a time when businesses had a face, and that face was family. Of course, the picture was not always sunny. One of the disadvantages of personal business on this scale is well exposed in this collection, with the overwhelming impression of constant small-scale – and not so small-scale – conflict within families, with neighbours, tenants and business and shipping rivals. There is a good deal of litigation on display here, not least over the Hays' landed and associated improvement activities. Luckily for us, these conflicts are caught on paper, including accusations of 'taunting, saucy, insolent' behaviour (p. 75).

What makes this book so interesting is the sheer range of materials and detail it gives: in one letter we can glean the lost incidentals of day-to-day life in Shetland in the 1770s – the make-up of households, families, occupations, illness and happiness. In another we can confidently map out the exotic imports being traded and with whom. Yes, the fishing and kelp industries are dominant, but luxuries such as brandy and gin are here too, broadening our perspective of the trading range of Shetland. Indeed, this book points towards a conclusion that the various trading opportunities and restrictions open to Shetlanders in what was a revolutionary period for all of Britain, takes it squarely away from any notion of being on the periphery of the action, but indeed, in the heart of it.

The author essentially leaves the reader to build the story of the Hays themselves, although an outline of their rise to prominence is given in the introduction. This reviewer would have welcomed more scholarly context to support the reader in understanding this fascinating family. Perhaps the author is planning a further volume, written in narrative style: I hope so, as they deserve greater attention from historians. Likewise, only a very brief history of the various archives and collections included in this book is given – perhaps there was nothing more to say on the matter: as with many family and small business collections, the Hay archives were lucky to have survived at all. Hayfield House was occupied by the Army during World War II and losses no doubt occurred – a familiar tale to many archivists, and we should be grateful that so much survived and has been presented to us here. It is through essential works such as this volume, that these archives, lucky to have survived at all, can be enjoyed and understood by a wider audience.

Annie Tindley

University of Newcastle

Karl Sabbagh, *The Trials of Lady Jane Douglas: The Scandal That Divided 18th Century Britain* (Newbold on Stour, Skyscraper, 2014). 403 pp. ISBN 978 0 99262701 0. Hbk. £16.99.

In Paris in July 1748 the beautiful and much admired Lady Jane Douglas gave birth to twins. Married, against the wishes of her brother the Duke of Douglas, to the charming but dissolute Colonel James Steuart, these were her first children. The news of the births spread quickly to Scotland and rumours circulated that the children were not Lady Jane's but orphans bought on the streets of Paris. The childless Duke of Douglas refused to accept these 'nunnery children' as his heirs and stopped the allowance which supported his sister and her family. Lady Jane returned to Britain to try to change his mind but was pursued for debt in London and Edinburgh. The second-born son, Sholto, always a weak child, died in 1753. His distraught and destitute mother died a few months later.

The Duke of Douglas married the redoubtable Dame Peggy Mains in 1758 who worked on him so unrelentingly in favour of the surviving twin that, ten days before his death in 1761, he named Archibald Steuart, henceforward Archibald Douglas, as heir to his estates, worth some £12,000. The Duke of Hamilton contested this in the Court of Session, kick-starting what was to be known as the Douglas Cause which lasted for eight years, cost the Hamilton and Douglas sides almost £54,000, a huge sum for the time, and absorbed the finest legal minds in Britain. Many of Scotland's judges cut their teeth as lawyers and made their reputations working on the case, among them James Burnett, who became Lord Monboddo, and Francis Garden, Lord Gardenstone. Some of the lawyers who went to France to locate witnesses later found themselves among the fifteen judges sitting on the case in the Court of Session.

The legal battle, which went against Douglas in the Court of Session but was won on appeal to the House of Lords in 1769, split society into 'Hamiltonians' and Douglassians': David Hume, Adam Smith and Dr Samuel Johnson were among those favouring the Hamilton side; James Boswell, William Robertson, the antiquarian, and Lord Kames, the Douglas side. It was Boswell who got to the crux of the case and its importance for eighteenth-century society, in a conversation with Lord Mansfield, who gave the final judgment in the case, that it concerned the principle of filiation 'on which we all depend, and every man is alarmed at the danger of that principle being taken away'.

In France, Denis Diderot, the author of the *Encyclopédie*, was called on to attest publicly to the poor French of letters purporting to be written by the man-midwife who had attended the birth of the twins. For such a fascinating and curious case which aroused such interest in Scotland, England and France, and which is full of insights into eighteenth-century society, both high and low, it is surprising how little it is known or studied today.

Karl Sabbagh, who has taken up the challenge of writing the first serious study of the case since Lillian de la Torre's *The Heir of Douglas* in 1953, navigates the voluminous sources with a sure grip. This is no mean feat: the Court of

Session case produced over 1,000 pages for both the pursuers' and defenders' proofs, so voluminous that the job of printing enough copies was shared between printers in Edinburgh and Paris; the judgment ran to ten volumes. Such was the complexity of the case that the judges asked for shorter memorials to be prepared, still some 1,600 pages between them leading Boswell to quip 'We shall know after this what a Scotch brief means'.

Sabbagh's research has taken him to sources in the National Records of Scotland and the National Library of Scotland (which both hold papers resulting from James Stuart's four-year-long investigations in Paris), the archives of the Earls of Home, the Archives Nationales in Paris as well as to Yale University. In addition he has trawled through numerous printed editions of contemporary correspondence where he has found interesting nuggets.

The complexities of the case are woven lightly through the narrative, never bogging the tale down with abstruse detail, and introducing us to a host of idiosyncratic characters: the eccentric Duke and Duchess of Douglas; the lawyer Francis Garden whose pet pig lay on his clothes on the floor and kept them warm; Boswell who wrote poetry, a *roman-à-clef*, and an edition of Lady Jane's correspondence in support of the Douglas side, the author of which was happy to write, anonymously, enthusiastic reviews of his own works. We meet, too, a range of the ordinary folk of mid-eighteenth-century Paris, from the tight-rope walker and glass-maker whose sons were allegedly purchased by the Scottish couple, to the innkeepers, midwives and police who gave statements to the investigators.

While the richness of the material might on occasion lead Sabbagh to a tendency for over-quotation, this is a mild criticism of a fascinating story well told. There is no bibliography but the quotations are well footnoted and there is an index.

Alison Rosie

National Records of Scotland